HERITAGE VALUES ASSESSMENT

PROPOSED DEMOLITION AND DEVELOPMENT

32 - 34 CHURCH STREET WOLLONGONG



RAPPOPORT PTY LTD © CONSERVATION ARCHITECTS AND HERITAGE CONSULTANTS

45 Hardie Street, Mascot NSW 2020 TFL: 9693-1788 FAX: 9317-5711 EMAIL: ask@rappoport.com.au

> January 2012 Job No.: 2012.1694

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1.0	FXECUTIVE SUMMARY
2,0	INTRODUCTION
3.0	HISTORICAL CONTEXT
4.0	PHYSICAL DESCRIPTION AND ANALYSIS
5.0	ASSESSMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE
6.0	RECOMMENDATION AND CONCLUSION
7.0	BIBLIOGRAPHY
APPEN	NDIX A

The following table forms part of the quality management control undertaken by Rappoport Pty. Itd regarding the monitoring of its intellectual property as issued.

Issue	Notes / Description	Date	Initials
1	Draft issued to Client for comment	16.01.12	АВ
2	Report Issued to ADM Architects	20.01.12	SR

RAPPOPORT PTY LTD - CONSERVATION ARCHITECTS & TERITAGE CONSULTANTS 45 HARDIE STREET, MASCOT NSW 2020 Tel: 9693-1788 - Fax: 9317-5711 - Email: ask@tappoport.com.au Web: www.rappoport.com.au

1.0 EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Rappoport Pty Etd - Heritage Consultants has prepared this report at the request of the Joint Regional Planning Panel (JRPP). In December 2011, the JRPP deferred its decision regarding the application for the construction of a residential flat building at 32-34 Church Street. The JRPP stated that the site is considered to have local significance and requested a:

'comprehensive assessment of the heritage significance of all buildings proposed to be demolished and further investigation of all archaeological items on the site.1 (NSW Government Joint Regional Planning Panel, 2011)

This report has been prepared to assess the heritage significance of the buildings proposed to be demolished. The requested further investigation of all archaeological items has been separately addressed. This report should be read in conjunction with the archaeological assessment.

This report concludes that neither of the two buildings are considered to have significant. heritage value,

RAPPOPORT PTY LTD CONSERVATION ARCHITECTS & TERITAGE CONSULTANTS 45 FIARDIE STREET, MASCOTINSW 2020 Tel: 9693/1788 - Fax: 9317/5711 - Email: ask@tappoporC.com.au Web: www.rappoport.com.au

2.0 INTRODUCTION

This report was prepared by Rappoport Pty LtJ - Heritage Consultants at the request of the Joint Regional Planning Panel (JRPP). The subject site is 32-34 Church Street, Wollongong which falls within the boundaries of Wollongong City Council.

37-34 Church Street are not currently listed on the Wollongong Local Environment Plan 2009 (LEP),

In 2010, an archaeological investigation of the site was prepared by Edward Higginbotham & Associates Pty Ltd. It is noted in that report that the house and grounds of 32 Church Street, Wollongong were listed, as an item of heritage significance, in the 1991 City of Wollongong Heritage Study. However on further investigation Edward Higginbotham & Associates Pty Ltd discovered that:

The address of this property was incorrectly identified. The correct address is 36 Church Street, Wollongong. The house was demolished to make way for the recent redevelopment of 36 Church Street, Wollongong, The heritage item has been removed from the Wollongong LEP, (Edward Higginbotham and Associates Pty Ltd, 2010, p. 2)

Furthermore the subject properties is not listed on the State Heritage Register, The National Heritage List, The Commonwealth Heritage List, or the National Trust of Australia (NSW) nor does it fall within the boundaries a Conservation Area.

The location of the subject items are shown in Figure 1 below.

RAPPOPORT PTY LTD CONSERVATION ARCHITECTS & TERITAGE CONSULTANTS 45 FIARDIE STREET, MASCOTINSW 2020 Tel: 9693/1788 Fax: 9317/5711 - Email: ask@rappoport.com.au Web: www.rappoport.com.au



Site Location. Red boundary indicates 32-34 Church Street, Wollongong Figure 1: (Source: Google Maps)

There are no heritage listed items in the vicinity of the subject site.

The methodology used in this Heritage Values Assessment is consistent with Assessing Heritage Significance Heritage Manual contained in the Heritage Branch of the NSW Office of Environment & Heritage published materials and has been prepared in accordance with the principles contained in the most recent edition of The Burra Charter (ICOMOS Australia).

Under no circumstances shall any party make copies of this report without prior permission from the author, Rappoport Pty Lte, who holds copyright for this report. No part of this report may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying or otherwise without the prior permission of Rappoport Pty Ltd.

RAPPOPORT PTY LTD CONSERVATION ARCHITECTS & TERITAGE CONSULTANTS 45 HARDIE STREET, MASCOT NSW 2020 Tel: 9693/1788 - Fax: 9317/5711 - Email: ask@rappoport.com.au Web: www.rappoport.com.au

Limitations

Please note that this report is based upon an assessment of the heritage issues only and will not purport to have reviewed or in any way endorsed decisions that are of a planning or compliance nature. Thus, it will be assumed that such matters will be assessed by others in terms which comply with the local Council's planning instruments such as the LEP and any pertinent DCP's - Similarly, the report does not purport to determine or assess any BCA. requirement, services related issue, contamination issue, structural integrity issue, legal matter or any other non-heritage and non-SEPP 1 related issue.

Rappoport has drawn its information concerning the property from secondary sources only. Primary research has not been included in this report, other than the general assessment of the physical conditions on site.

RAPPOPORT PTY LTD CONSERVATION ARCHITECTS & TERITAGE CONSULTANTS. 45 HARDIE STREET, MASCOT NSW 2020. Tel: 9693/1788 - Fax: 9317/5711 - Email: ask@iappoport.com.au Web: www.rappoport.com.au

3.0 HISTORICAL CONTEXT

3.1 Elistoric Timeline

The following historic timeline has been developed using the information provided in the *Report on Test Excavation in Advance of Proposed Redevelopment, 32-34 Church Street, Wollangong, NSW* prepared by Edward Higginbotham & Associates Pty Ltd in April 2010. The full history provided within that report has been extracted and can be found in *Appendix A*.

Date	Event
1819	Explorer Charles Throsby gives his nephew Charles Throsby Smith
	(Smith) the right to his 300 acres Illawarra grant that had been
	promised by Governor Lachlan.
1823	Smith is directed by Surveyor General John Oxley to occupy the land
	originally occupied by Charles Throsby.
1825	300 acres ac Ilawarra marked out for Smith by Surveyor James
	McBrien.
1826	Smith is recorded as having: cleared 60 acres; built a house; 3convict
	servants; 70 cattle; 5 horses; 25 acres of felled timber; two carts: one
	plough and one harrow and built a small house on the present day
	location the corner of Harbour and Smith Street, Wollongong.
1828	Smith built a larger dwelling, in a different location, known as 'Bustle
	Farm" or 'Bustle Hill"
1829	A survey records Smith as having 300 acres, 6 horses, 86 cattle, a
	barn, a stable. Dwelling house, kitchen, 3 convict servants, 3 free
	servants, 3.5 miles of fencing.
1835	The land known as Bustle Farm was formally granted to Charles
	Throsby Smith.
1859	Municipality of Wollongong established. Smith is appointed as
	Returning Officer for the election.
1876	25 September Smith dies leaving many descendants.
1878	Title of Smith's grant is conveyed to Vincent Wanostrocht Giblin and
	Timothy O'Sullivan Green, as trustee for the sale of Smith's grant.
1879	Smith's land is subdivided into 20 sections with a grid of street and
	auctioned on 15th January, Mary Ann Franklin, wife of Frederick
	Augustus Franklin, is the successful bidder for the land containing
	Bustle Hall. Bustle Hall is renamed Buona Vista.
1905	Mary Ann Franklin dies on 9th December, A valuation describes the
	property as being about 6 acres, the cottage as having a wide
	verandah hall, 2 sitting, 4 bedroom, bathroom, kitchen, servant's

RAPPOPORT PTY LTD - CONSERVATION ARCHITECTS & TERITAGE CONSULTANTS 45 HARDIE STREET, MASCOT NSW 2020

Tel: 9693/1788 - Fax: 9317/5711 - Email: ask@tappoport.com.au

Fax: 95-7-5711 - Email: ask@tappoj
Web: www.rappoport.com.au

	room, stables and outhouses. Buona Vista was subdivided but the sale
	was not successful and only one plot was sold to Timothy Wood Lee.
1912	The Perpetual Trustee Co Ed, Timothy Wood Lee, Joseph Matthew
	Staffand William McKenzie signed a conveyance for the remaining
	land.
1913	The land was subdivided into 28 lots, Bustle Hall/Buona Vista being
	located on Lot 4.
1916	Title of Lots 3-5 and 8-12 is transferred to Margaret McKenzie, wife of
	William McKenzie
1922	A valuation of lots 3-5 was carried out by the Valuer-General, The
	land was said to contain a brick cottage with 6 rooms, a kitchen and
	iron roof.
1933	Margaret McKenzie dies on April 20th, The valuation of her land
	notes that the house is now called "Ellangowan". The property passed
	by Transmission to Maggie Stichnoch, wife of Ludwig Ferdinand
	Stichnoch.
1935	The land is subdivided. For 1 of that subdivision included the main
	part of 'Bustle Hall' Lots 1 and 2 were transferred to Norman Bain
	Finlayson.
1 of 1 DP 331€	i87
1935	Finlayson mortgaged the property and it is then believed he
	demolished "Bustle Hall" and built a new dwelling.
1959	Lot 1 DP 331687 was subdivided into Lot A and B. Loc B was
	transferred to Edward Leslie Milgrave. No further information about
	either Lots is provided.
1 of 2 DP 331€	i87
1940	Title transferred to Jess Flsie Sneddon, wife of Andrew Sneddon, with
	a covenant that no flats were built on the site.
1943	The fitle was transferred to Edward Leslie Milgrave.
1965	The covenant restricting building of flats was removed.
1975	Title was transferred by transmission to Rowena Vaughan Milgrave.
	No further information about the lot is provided

During the course of this study, Rappoport conducted research into all of the previous owners and uncovered two people of interest; Frederick Augustus Franklin and Timothy Wood Lee.

Frederick Augustus Franklin was an English Civil Engineer. He studied in England under Sir-Joseph Paxton. Franklin arrived in Australia in 1865 after working on the construction of railways in India. In NSW, Franklin was employed by the government as a Civil engineer specialising in the construction of railways and bridges (Institute of Civil Engineers, 1909, p. 293).

RAPPOPORT PTY LTD - CONSERVATION ARCHITECTS & TERITAGE CONSULTANTS 45 HARDIE STREET, MASCOT NSW 2020 Tel: 9693-1788 - Fax: 9317-5711 - Email: ask@tappoport.com.au Web: www.rappoport.com.au

Franklin also practised privately and in the 1880s, Franklin was involved with the layout of Centennial Park. It seems that there were several plans formulated for Centennial Park and it is not known whose plan was adopted however the original design for Centennia. Park has been likened to Paxton's Birkenhead Park and the grounds of the Crystal Palace at Sydenham (Centennial Parklands, 2002, p. 6).

He is also believed to have been involved with the layout of Stuart Park. Wollongong and Grew up plans for the distribution of Streetlamps in the borough of Wollongong, (National Library of Australia)

In the 1890s, Franklin travelled the principal towns of NSW delivering a talk about the upper Ganges Canal and other systems of irrigation in India (National Library of Australia).

Franklin died on the 4th February 1909 at age 75. He was returning to Australia from England after receiving training on railways, (Institute of Civil Engineers, 1909, p. 293).

Little is known about Dr Timothy Wood Lee except that is believed to have been the Mine-Doctor for Mount Kembla at the time of the 1902 disaster. (University of Wollongong)



Figure 2: Timothy Wood Lee (Source: University of Wollongong Archives, collection D158/6/52)

RAPPOPORT PTY LTD CONSERVATION ARCHITECTS & TERITAGE CONSULTANTS 45 FIARDIE STREET, MASCOT NSW 2020 Tel: 9693/1788 - Fax: 9317/5711 - Email: ask@tappoport.com.au Web: www.rappoport.com.au

4.0 PHYSICAL DESCRIPTION AND ANALYSIS

Church Street runs from the west of the harbour south towards the city travelling through Smith's Hill, Church Hill, past St Michael's Anglican Cathedral, then to the mall at Wollongong Central,

4.1 32 Church Street, Wollongong

32 Church Street Wollongong was originally constructed as a single storey dwelling and has since been converted for use as three separated residential units. The design of the building is consistent with a heavily modified and extended dwelling and can be separated into two distinct areas being:

- the original 1930s component ; and
- the later extension added in the late 1960s/early 1970s. •

32 Church Street is comprised of a single storey east-west orientated building. The majority of the building has a green tiled hipped roof with wide over hanging caves, except for the enclosed verandah which has a flat roof.

The 1930s section of the building is clad in painted render while the 1960s addition is comprised of painted brick, with a timber infill to the gable end.

Each of the units is accessed by a separate elevated entry. The external pebble dash steps are bounded by a decorative metal balustrade and terrazzo door step, the details of which are consistent to each dwelling suggesting that these were added in the later development phase.

The entry porch of the 1930s component, leads into sun room running the full width of the property. The exterior window details of the sun room are consistent with late 1960s early 1970s period suggesting that the sunroom was enclosed around the same time as the property. was extended. The internal wall of the sun room contains a set of 3 sliding sash windows which are believed to be original to the 1930s structure.

The lounge area of this unit contains several features which appear to date from the original construction including, the fireplace, internal door and moulded cornice. This room is not without alteration and a sliding aluminium window has been inserted to the southern wall. The kitchen contains what is thought to be an original arched window and the bedroom contains a timber batten ceiling and further evidence of an enclosed verandah. Many of these surviving internal details are indicators of the Inter-war Georgian Revival Style however the exterior of

RAPPOPORT PTY LTD CONSERVATION ARCHITECTS & LERITAGE CONSULTANTS 45 HARDIE STREET, MASCOT NSW 2020 Tel: 9693/1788 Fax: 9317/5711 - Email: ask@rappoport.com.au Web: www.rappoport.com.au

the building does not express this Style and many of the features may have been lost during the adaption and extension work.

By contrast the interior of the 1960s/70s apartments contain few decorative elements. Visual inspection of these apartments confirm that they were designed as apartments and have no connection to the original dwelling i.e. they were not part of a former extended living area which was converted for use as apartments,

The grounds of the property contain a long concrete driveway, large carport with decorative breeze blocks side wall, large lawn areas and a decorative brick fence to the Church Street boundary with bricked in central pedestrian opening,

The photographs below taken by Rappoport Pty Ltd in December 2011 provide a visual survey. of the place.



32 Church Street, Wollongong. Figure 3: (Source: Rappoport Pty Ltd, December2011)

RAPPOPORT PTY LTD CONSERVATION ARCHITECTS & TERITAGE CONSULTANTS 45 FIARDIE STREET, MASCOTINSW 2020 Tel: 9693/1788 - Fax: 9317/5711 - Email: ask@tappoport.com.au Web: www.rappoport.com.au



Figure 4: Detail of wide overhanging eaves and entry purch to one of the apartments. (Source: Rappoport Pty Ltd, 2011).



Figure 5: Entry to enclosed verandah. (Source: Rappoport Pty Ltd, 2011)

RAPPOPORT PTY LTD CONSERVATION ARCHITECTS & TERITAGE CONSULTANTS. 45 HARDIE STREET, MASCOT NSW 2020 Tel: 9693/1788 - Fax: 9317/5711 - Email: ask@iappoport.com.a.i Web: www.rappoport.com.au



Figure 6: Detail of exterior of the property. This section of the property is thought to have been added in the 1960s/70s. (Source: Rappoport Pty Ltd, 2011)





RAPPOPORT PTY LTD - CONSERVATION ARCHITECTS & TERITAGE CONSULTANTS 45 HARDIE STREET, MASCOT NSW 2020 Tel: 9693-1788 - Fax: 9317-5711 - Email: ask@tappoport.com.au Web: www.rappoport.com.au



Figure 8: Gable end of building consistent with 1960s/70s development. (Source: Rappoport Pty Ltd, 2011).



Figure 9: Car port: (Source: Rappoport Pty Ltd, 2011).

> RAPPOPORT PTY LTD CONSERVATION ARCHITECTS & TERITAGE CONSULTANTS. 45 HARDIE STREET, MASCOT NSW 2020 Tel: 9693/1788 - Fax: 9317/5711 - Email: ask@rappoport.com.au Web: www.rappoport.com.au



Figure 10: Breeze block wall to end of car port. (Source: Rappoport Pty Ltd, 2011).



Figure 11: View of long driveway and additional vehicle parking. (Source: Rappoport Ply Ltd, 2011).

RAPPOPORT PTY LTD CONSERVATION ARCHITECTS & TERITAGE CONSULTANTS 45 HARDIE STREET, MASCOT NSW 2020 Tel: 9693/1788 - Fax: 9317/5711 - Email: ask@rappoport.com.a.r Web: www.rappoport.com.au Page 15



Figure 12: Brick fence defines the church street boundary. Note the original pedestrian entry to the centre of the wall (Source: Rappoport Pty Ltd, 2011)



Figure 13: 1930s Apartment: Interior detail of enclosed verandah. (Source: Rappoport Pty Ltd, 2011)

RAPPOPORT PTY LTD CONSERVATION ARCHITECTS & TERITAGE CONSULTANTS 45 HARDIE STREET, MASCOT NSW 2020 Tel: 9693/1788 - Fax: 9317/5711 - Email: ask@iappoport.com.a.i Web: www.rappoport.com.au



Figure 14: 1930s Apartment: Detail of three sliding sash windows thought to be original to the 1930s phase of development. (Source: Rappoport Pty Etd, 2011)



Figure 15: 1930s Apartment: Living area note the door, fireplace and comice all of which are consistent with 1930s design. (Source: Rappoport Pty Etd, 2011).

RAPPOPORT PTY LTD CONSERVATION ARCHITECTS & TERITAGE CONSULTANTS. 45 HARDIE STREET, MASCOT NSW 2020 Tel: 9693/1788 - Fax: 9317/5711 - Email: ask@tappoport.com.au Web: www.rappoport.com.au



Figure 16: 1930s Apartment: Sliding sash windows as viewed from the interior. It is presumed that the sliding aluminium windows was added at the same time that verandah was enclosed.

(Source: Rappoport Pty Ltd, 2011)



Figure 17: 1930s Apartment: Galley Kitchen note the fireplace to the left of the picture and the arched window to the centre of the picture. (Source: Rappoport Pty Ltf, 2011)

RAPPOPORT PTY LTD - CONSERVATION ARCHITECTS & TERITAGE CONSULTANTS 45 HARDIE STREET, MASCOT NSW 2020 Tel: 9693-1788 - Fax: 9317-5711 - Email: ask@tappoport.com.au Web: www.rappoport.com.au

Report issued 20.01.12

Page 18



Figure 18:

1930s Abartment: 1930s Timber Batten ceiling. (Source: Rappoport Pty Ltd, 2011)



Figure 19:

1930s Apartment: The bedroom appears to have been extended into an enclosed verandah. (Source: Rappoport Ply Ltd, December2011)

RAPPOPORT PTY LTD CONSERVATION ARCHITECTS & TERITAGE CONSULTANTS 45 HARDIE STREET, MASCOT NSW 2020 Tel: 9693-1788 - Fax: 9317-5711 - Email: ask@iappoport.com.a.i Web: www.rappoport.com.au



Figure 20: 1960s/70s Apartment: Note the lack of cornices, joinery or other design features. (Source: Rappoport Pty Ltd, 2011)



Figure 21: 1960s/70s Apartment: Kitchen possibly dating from the 1980s. (Source: Rappoport Pty Ltd, 2011)

RAPPOPORT PTY LTD - CONSERVATION ARCHITECTS & TERITAGE CONSULTANTS 45 HARDIE STREET, MASCOT NSW 2020 Tel: 9693-1788 - Fax: 9317-5711 - Email: ask@tappoport.com.au Web: www.rappoport.com.au Report ssued 20.01.17 - Page 20



Figure 22: 1960s/70s Apartment: Sunken bath and tiles consistent with late 1960s design. (Source: Rappoport Pty Ltd, 2011).

RAPPOPORT PTY LTD CONSERVATION ARCHITECTS & TERITAGE CONSULTANTS. 45 FIARDIE STREET, MASCOT NSW 2020 Tel: 9693/1788 - Fax: 9317/5711 - Email: ask@rappoport.com.au Web: www.rappoport.com.au

4.2 34 Church Street, Wollongong

34 Church Street is an elevated two storey building, the exterior of which is clad with painted render. The dwelling is set under a green tiled hipped roof. The windows are sliding sash and the main entry is set under a small porch. The exterior of the building is showing signs of wear and tear and has been subject to a deferred maintenance schedule.

The Church Street boundary of the property is defined by a brick fence which also acts as a retaining wall to the front terraced garden. The concrete driveway leads to an exposed brick. double garage. To the immediate north of the garage are the main steps leading to the single opening entry door, with adjoining glazed side windows. The purch is topped by a concrete slab roof and supported by an exposed brick wall which has a decorative rounded edge.

Front door opens on to a large hallway. The hallway contains stairs to the upper level and several doors accessing each of the lower level rooms,

The interior has also been subject to a schedule of deferred maintenance the paint work and wall paper are both seen to be peeling from the walls.

This building contains few original features and those which survive are thought to be the light. pendants, layout and half-turn stair which is lit by a full length window.

Additional living accommodation has been added by means on a externally accessed sun room. to the lower level this tao is in poor condition.

Stylistically this building has clearly been influenced by many styles: the rear façade, and elongated stair window are reminiscent of the Inter-war Georgian Revival Style; the large hallway and half-turn stairs are very similar to a Victorian floor plan; and while the principal facade does not adhere to any of the key indicators of anyone of Australia's identified architectural styles it does however appear to have been influenced by the Inter-war Functionalist Style, (Apperly, 1989)

The photographs below taken by Rappoport Pty Ltd in December 2011 provide a visual survey of the place.

RAPPOPORT PTY LTD CONSERVATION ARCHITECTS & TERITAGE CONSULTANTS 45 FIARDIE STREET, MASCOTINSW 2020 Tel: 9693/1788 Fax: 9317/5711 - Email: ask@rappoport.com.au Web: www.rappoport.com.au



Figure 23: 34 Church Street, Wollongong. (Source: Rappoport Pty Ltd, December2011)



Figure 24: Steps to entry porch and front door. Note the curved supporting wall of the porch. . (Source: Rappoport Pty Ltd, 2011)

RAPPOPORT PTY LTD CONSERVATION ARCHITECTS & TERITAGE CONSULTANTS. 45 HARDIE STREET, MASCOT NSW 2020 Tel: 9693/1788 - Fax: 9317/5711 - Email: ask@iappoport.com.a.i Web: www.rappoport.com.au



Figure 25: Rear of 34 Church Street with separate laundry extension. (Source: Rappoport Pty Ltd, 2011)



Figure 26:

Carden at 34 Church Street, Wollongorig. (Source: Rappoport Pty Ltd, 2011)

RAPPOPORT PTY LTD CONSERVATION ARCHITECTS & TERITAGE CONSULTANTS. 45 HARDIE STREET, MASCOT NSW 2020 Tel: 9693/1788 - Fax: 9317/5711 - Email: ask@iappoport.com.a.i Web: www.rappoport.com.au Page 24



Figure 27 Hints of former landscaping can be seen around the now minimally maintained garden. (Source: Rappoport Pty Ltd, 2011)



Steps to garden terrace. Figure 28: (Source: Rappoport Pty Ltd, 2011)

> RAPPOPORT PTY LTD CONSERVATION ARCHITECTS & TERITAGE CONSULTANTS. 45 FIARDIE STREET, MASCOT NSW 2020 Tel: 9693/1788 - Fax: 9317/5711 - Email: ask@rappoport.com.au Web: www.rappoport.com.au



Figure 29: Detail of brick fence to Church Street boundary. (Source: Rappoport Pty Ltd, 2011)



Figure 30: Main entry hall of 34 Church Street containing stairs and doors to living areas. (Source: Rappopor, Pty Ed, 2011).

RAPPOPORT PTY LTD CONSERVATION ARCHITECTS & TERITAGE CONSULTANTS 45 HARDIE STREET, MASCOT NSW 2020 Tel: 9693/1788 - Fax: 9317/5711 - Email: ask@iappoport.com.a.i Web: www.rappoport.com.au



Figure 31: Detail of glass doors leading from the main entry hall. (Source: Rappoport Pty Ltd, 2011).



Figure 32: Interior of one of the ground floor rooms containing simple joinery. (Source: Rappoport Pty Ltd, 2011).

RAPPOPORT PTY LTD CONSERVATION ARCHITECTS & TERITAGE CONSULTANTS. 45 HARDIE STREET, MASCOT NSW 2020 Tel: 9693-1788 - Fax: 9317-5711 - Email: ask@iappoport.com.a.i Web: www.rappoport.com.au Page 27



The half-turn staircase leading to the upstaris bedroom accomodation Figure 33: (Source: Rappoport Pty Ltd, 2011)



Figure 34: Interior of the kitchen which has not been updated in some time. (Source: Rappoport Pty Ltd, 2011).

RAPPOPORT PTY LTD CONSERVATION ARCHITECTS & TERITAGE CONSULTANTS 45 HARDIE STREET, MASCOT NSW 2020 Tel: 9693/1788 - Fax: 9317/5711 - Email: ask@iappoport.com.a.i Web: www.rappoport.com.au



Figure 35: Detail of kitchen workspaces. (Source: Rappoport Pty Ltd, 2011)



Figure 36: Example of bedrooin accomodation to upper level, demonstrating the same simple joinery seen to the lower level. (Source: Rappoport Pty Ltd, 2011)

RAPPOPORT PTY LTD CONSERVATION ARCHITECTS & TERITAGE CONSULTANTS 45 HARDIE STREET, MASCOT NSW 2020 Tel: 9693/1788 - Fax: 9317/5711 - Email: ask@iappoport.com.a.i Web: www.rappoport.com.au Page 29



Figure 37: Detail of bathroom to the upper level. (Source: Rappoport Pty Ltd, 2011)



Figure 38: Upper level balcony. Note the wide overhanging eaves. (Source: Rappoport Pty Ltd, 2011)

RAPPOPORT PTY LTD CONSERVATION ARCHITECTS & TERITAGE CONSULTANTS. 45 HARDIE STREET, MASCOT NSW 2020 Tel: 9693/1788 - Fax: 9317/5711 - Email: ask@iappoport.com.a.i Web: www.rappoport.com.au Page 30



1930s style light fitting tho, ght to be original to the property. Figure 39: (Source: Rappoport Pty Ltd, 2011)



Figure 40: Half-turn stair as viewed from upper level landing. (Source: Rappoport Pty Ltd, 2011)

RAPPOPORT PTY LTD CONSERVATION ARCHITECTS & TERITAGE CONSULTANTS 45 HARDIE STREET, MASCOT NSW 2020 Tel: 9693/1788 - Fax: 9317/5711 - Email: ask@iappoport.com.a.i Web: www.rappoport.com.au



Figure 41: Detail of room located behind the basement level garage (Source: Rappoport Pty Ltd, 2011)



Figure 42: Door leading to garden from basement room (Source: Rappoport Pty Ltd, 2011)

RAPPOPORT PTY LTD - CONSERVATION ARCHITECTS & TERITAGE CONSULTANTS 45 HARDIE STREET, MASCOT NSW 2020 Tel: 9693-1788 - Fax: 9317-5711 - Email: ask@tappoport.com.au Web: www.rappoport.com.au Report ssued 20.01.17 - Page 32



The wall to the right is thought to be the original external wall of the property and the Figure 43: room is a later extension. Note the damage of the celling, (Source: Rappoport Pty Ltd, 2011)

RAPPOPORT PTY LTD CONSERVATION ARCHITECTS & TERITAGE CONSULTANTS. 45 FIARDIE STREET, MASCOT NSW 2020 Tel: 9693/1788 - Fax: 9317/5711 - Email: ask@rappoport.com.a.r Web: www.rappoport.com.au

5.0 ASSESSMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE

5.1 Application of Significance Criteria

An assessment of the heritage value of the site, as an archaeological resource, was carried out as part of the Report on Test Exceptation in Advance of proposed redevelopment, 32-34 Church Street, Wollongong, NSW prepared by Edward Higginbotham & Associates Pty Ltd in April 2010 which found that the site had Historical. Associative, Aesthetic, Social, Technical/Research, Rarity and Representative heritage values.

It should be noted that Rappoport Pty Ltd does not dispute any of the findings with in the aforementioned assessment. However, given the archaeological nature of the assessment, the heritage values of the existing buildings were not considered. The following assessment examines the heritage values of the two buildings located at 32 and 34 Church Street, Wollongong. The assessment is based upon seven separate criteria established by the Heritage Branch of the NSW Office of Environment & Heritage.

5.2 Assessment of Significance - 32 Church Street, Wollongong Lot 2 DP 331867

Criterion (a) – Historical Significance

An item is important in the course, or pattern, of NSW's cultural or natural history (state significance); OR it is important in the course, or pattern of the local area's cultural or natural history (local significance).

Response - The building at 32 Church Street was constructed in the 1930s after the demolition. of Bustle Hall and then further extended in the 1960s/70s. While the construction of the building can be linked to the demolition phase of Bustle Hall it is not considered that this is expressed in the fabric or architectural expression of the building.

The dwelling at 32 Church Street does not meet this criterion.

RAPPOPORT PTY LTD CONSERVATION ARCHITECTS & LERITAGE CONSULTANTS 45 FIARDIE STREET, MASCOTINSW 2020 Tel: 9693/1788 - Fax: 9317/5711 - Email: ask@tappoport.com.au Web: www.rappoport.com.au Page 34

Criterion (b) - Associational Significance

An item has strong or special association with the life or works of a person, or group of persons, of importance in NSW's cultural or natural history (state significance); OR it has strong or special association with the life or works of a person, or group of persons, of importance in the cultural or natural history of the local area (local significance).

Response - All association with persons of interest, identified in the Archaeological Assessment and Section 2 of this report, occurred prior to the construction of the existing building at 32 Church Street.

No special or strong association, specifically relating to the building at 32 Church Street, have been uncovered during the preparation of this report.

The dwelling at 32 Church Street does not meet this criterion.

Criterion (c) Aesthetic Significance

An item is important in demonstrating aesthetic characteristics and/or high degree of creative or technical achievement in NSW (state significance); OR it is important in demonstrating aesthetic characteristics and/or high degree of creative or technica, achievement in the local area (local significance).

Response - The building at 32 Church Street does not demonstrate a high degree of creative or technical achievement. While the interior of the 1930s apartment does contain some elements which are indicators of the Inter-War Georgian Revival Style they are not considered to be outstanding and nor do they translate to the exterior of the building. Furthermore, the building has undergone substantial alteration and addition, to make it suitable for use as multiple dwellings, these alterations have further degraded the properties aesthetic appearance and removed it original architectural features.

It is not considered that the house demonstrates aesthetic characteristics and/or high degree of creative or technical achievement in NSW or the local area.

The dwelling at 32 Church Street does not meet this criterion.

RAPPOPORT PTY LTD CONSERVATION ARCHITECTS & TERITAGE CONSULTANTS 45 FIARDIE STREET, MASCOT NSW 2020 Tel: 9693/1788 - Fax: 9317/5711 - Email: ask@rappoport.com.au Web: www.rappoport.com.au Page 35

Criterion (d) – Social Significance

An item has a strong or special association with a particular community or cultural group in NSW for social, cultural or spiritual reasons (state significance); OR has strong or special association with a particular community or cultural group in NSW for social, cultural or spiritual reasons (local significance),

Response - The building located at 32 Church Street does not have any known associations with any particular community or cultural group and therefore does not meet this criterion.

The building at 32 Church Street does not meet this criterion.

Criterion (e) - Technical/Research Significance

An item has potential to yield information that will contribute to an understanding of NSW's cultural or natural history (state significance); OR has potential to yield information that will contribute to an understanding of the area's cultural or natural history (local significance).

Response - As previously discussed the building at 32 Church Street is constructed of standard materials and does not represent any particular building design. It is not considered that this building has the potential to yield any further information about the site, history of Wollongong or the greater NSW area.

The dwelling at 32 Church Street does not meet this criterion.

Criterion (f) – Rarity

An item possesses uncommon, rare or endangered aspects of NSW's cultural or natural history. (state significance); OR possesses uncommon, rare or endangered aspects of the area's cultural or natural history (local significance).

Response - As mentioned above, the building is without exception. It is considered to be a typical example of a building heavily modified in the 1960s/70s. It is therefore is not considered rare.

The dwelling at 32 Church Street does not meet this criterion.

Criterion (g) - Representativeness

An item is important in demonstrating the principal characteristics of a class of NSW's cultural or natural places or cultural or natural environments (state significance); OR is important in demonstrating the principal characteristics of a class of the area's cultural or natural places or cultural and natural environments (local significance),

Response - The dwelling at 32 Church Street does not meet this criterion.

RAPPOPORT PTY LTD CONSERVATION ARCHITECTS & LERITAGE CONSULTANTS 45 FIARDIE STREET, MASCOTINSW 2020 Tel: 9693/1788 - Fax: 9317/5711 - Email: ask@rappoport.com.au Web: www.rappoport.com.au Page 36
HERITAGE VALUES ASSESSMENT = 32-34 CHURC I STREET, WOLLONGONG

5.4 Statement of Cultural Significance - 32 Church Street, Wollongong

The building at 32 Church Street is not considered to demonstrate significant heritage value. The original 1930s building was constructed after the demolition of Bustle Hall. However, there is no evidence, in terms of re-use of fabric or architectural detailing to provide a tangible connection between the demolition of Bustle Hall and the construction of 32 Church Street.

While the interior of the 1930s apartment does contain some elements which are indicators of the Inter-War Georgian Revival Style, they are not considered to be outstanding and nor do they translate to the exterior of the building. Furthermore, the building has undergone substantial alteration and addition, to make it suitable for use as multiple dwellings, these alterations have further degraded the properties aesthetic appearance and removed it original architectural features.

The building does not have any special or significant associations with any persons of groups of persons nor does it possess a high degree of creative achievement. Similarly, the building is not considered to be rare or have the potential to yield further technical knowledge or information.

5.5Assessment of Significance - 34 Church Street, Wollongong Lot 1 DP 331867

Criterion (a) Historical Significance

An item is important in the course, or pattern, of NSW's cultural or natural history (state significance); OR it is important in the course, or pattern of the local area's cultural or natural history (local significance).

Response - The building at 34 Church Street, like 32 Church Street, was constructed in the 1930s after the demolition of Bustle Hall and subdivision of the land. While the date of construction can be linked to the demolition phase of Bustle Hall it is not considered that this phase is expressed in the fabric or architectural expression of the building.

The dwelling at 34 Church Street does not meet this criterion.

RAPPOPORT PTY LTD CONSERVATION ARCHITECTS & LERITAGE CONSULTANTS 45 FIARDIE STREET, MASCOTINSW 2020 Tel: 9693/1788 - Fax: 9317/5711 - Email: ask@tappoport.com.au Web: www.rappoport.com.au Page 37

HERITAGE VALUES ASSESSMENT 32-34 CHURC I STREET, WOLLONGONG

Criterion (b) - Associational Significance

An item has strong or special association with the life or works of a person, or group of persons, of importance in NSW's cultural or natural history (state significance); OR it has strong or special association with the life or works of a person, or group of persons, of importance in the cultural or natural history of the local area (local significance).

Response - All association with persons of interest, identified in the Archaeological Assessment and Section 2 of this report, occurred prior to the construction of the existing building at 34 Church Street.

The dwelling at 34 Church Street does not meet this criterion.

Criterion (c) - Aesthetic Significance

An item is important in demonstrating aesthetic characteristics and/or high degree of creative or technical achievement in NSW (state significance); OR it is important in demonstrating aesthetic characteristics and/or high degree of creative or technical achievement in the local area (local significance).

Response - As discussed in Section 3.2 of this report 34 Church Street has drawn influence. from several key style phases indicative of Australia architectural design including. Inter-war Georgian Revival, Victorian and Inter-war Functionalist, Unfortunately, this has resulted in an in-cohesive design. Similarly the building has been constructed utilising standard construction techniques and materials,

The building is a typical example of a 1930/40s building and it is considered that there are better examples of this era within North Wollongong and the wider south coast region.

The dwelling at 34 Church Street does not meet this criterion.

Criterion (d) – Social Significance

An item has a strong or special association with a particular community or cultural group in NSW for social, cultural or spiritual reasons (state significance); OR has strong or special association with a particular community or cultural group in NSW for social, cultural or spiritual reasons (local significance),

Response - The dwelling located at 34 Church Street does not have any known associations with any particular community or cultural group and therefore does not meet this criterion.

The dwelling at 34 Church Street does not meet this criterion.

RAPPOPORT PTY LTD CONSERVATION ARCHITECTS & TERITAGE CONSULTANTS 45 FIARDIE STREET, MASCOT NSW 2020 Tel: 9693/1788 - Fax: 9317/5711 - Email: ask@rappoport.com.au Web: www.rappoport.com.au Page 38

HERITAGE VALUES ASSESSMENT 32-34 CHURC I STREET, WOLLONGONG

Criterion (e) – Technical/Research Significance

An item has potential to yield information that will contribute to an understanding of NSW's cultural or natural history (state significance): OR has potential to yield information that will contribute to an understanding of the area's cultural or natural history (local significance).

Response - The building at 34 Church Street is considered to be a common building constructed using standard construction techniques which does have the potential to yield any further information about the cultural or natural history of Wollongong or the wider South Coast Region.

The dwelling at 34 Church Street dors not meet this criterion.

Criterion (f) – Rarity

An item possesses uncommon, rare or endangered aspects of NSW's cultural or natural history (state significance); OR possesses uncommon, rare or endangered aspects of the area's cultural or natural history (local significance).

Response - As montioned above, the dwelling is a typical example of its era. Many examples of this building type can be seen in the local area and within most Wollongong and the wider South Coast Region. It is therefore is not considered rare.

The dwelling at 34 Church Street does not meet this criterion.

Criterion (g) – Representativeness

An item is important in demonstrating the principal characteristics of a class of NSW's cultural or natural places or cultural or natural environments (state significance); OR is important in demonstrating the principal characteristics of a class of the area's cultural or natural places or cultural and natural environments (local significance).

Response - The dwelling at 34 Church Street does not meet this criterion.

RAPPOPORT PTY LTD CONSERVATION ARCHITECTS & TERITAGE CONSULTANTS 45 FIARDIE STREET, MASCOT NSW 2020 Tel: 9693/1788 - Fax: 9317/5711 - Email: ask@rappoport.com.au Web: www.rappoport.com.au Page 39

HERITAGE VALUES ASSESSMENT = 32-34 CHURC | STREET, WOLLONGONC

5.6 Statement of Cultural Significance - 34 Church Street, Wollongong

The building at 34 Church Street is not considered to demonstrate significant heritage value. The building was constructed after the demolition and subdivision of Bustle Hall. However, there is no evidence, in terms of re-use of fabric or architectural detailing to provide a tangible connection between the demolition of Bustle Hall and the construction of 34 Church Street.

While the design of the building was clearly influenced by several design phases and styles the building does not demonstrate any of these phases to an exemplary standard nor does it have the potential to yield further technical information or provide any further information about the history of Wollongong.

RAPPOPORT PTY LTD CONSERVATION ARCHITECTS & TERITAGE CONSULTANTS 45 HARDIE STREET, MASCOTINSW 2020 Tel: 9693-1788 - Fax: 9317-5711 - Email: ask@tappoport.com.au Web: www.rappoport.com.au Report ssued 20.01.17 - Page 40

HERITAGE VALUES ASSESSMENT 32-34 CHURC I STREET, WOLLONGONG

6.0 RECOMMENDATION AND CONCLUSION

In accordance with the above observations, we are of the opinion that the buildings located at 32 and 34 Church Street, Wollongong are not considered to have sufficient heritage values to warrant protection under the NSW Heritage Act (1977) or within Schedule 5 of the Wollongong LEP,

Rappoport Pty Ltd recommends the current condition of the two properties is captured through photographic archival recording prepared in accordance with the guidelines prepared by the Heritage Branch of NSW Office of Environment & Heritage prior to the commencement of work. This will ensure that a lasting record of the current phase of occupation is available for future reference.

RAPPOPORT PTY LTD CONSERVATION ARCHITECTS & LERITAGE CONSULTANTS 45 FIARDIE STREET, MASCOTINSW 2020 Tel: 9693/1788 - Fax: 9317/5711 - Email: ask@iappoport.com.au Web: www.rappoport.com.au Page 41

HERITAGE VALUES ASSESSMENT 32-34 CHURC I STREET, WOLLONGONG

7.0 BIBLIOGRAPHY

- (n.d.). Retrieved 2012-14, January, from University of Wollongong: http://encore.library.uow.edu.au/iii/cpro/DigitalItemViewPage.external?sp=1000723
- Apperly, J. a. (1989). A Pictorial Guide to Identifying Australian Architecture: Style and Terms from 1788 to Present, Angus and Robertson,

Centennial Parklands, (2002), Tree Masterplan Vol 2 .

- Ching, F., 1995, A Visual Dictionary of Architecture. John Wiley & Sons.
- Edward Higginbotham and Associates Pty Etd. (2010). Report on Test Excavation in Advance of redevelopment 32-34 Church Street, Wollongong, NSW.

Institute of Civil Engineers. (1909, January). Minutes of Proceedings, Volume 177,

- National Library of Australia, (n.d.), Retrieved 01 2012, 14, from Trove: http://trove.nla.gov.au/work/19648398?#
- NSW Government Joint Regional Planning Panel, (2011, December 02), Southern Region Media Release, Retrieved January 12, 2012, from Joint Regional Planning Panel: http://jrpp.nsw.gov.au/LinkClick.aspx?fileticket=rjorFBVsBAY%3d&tabid=38&language =en-AU

RAPPOPORT PTY LTD CONSERVATION ARCHITECTS & TERITAGE CONSULTANTS 45 FIARDIE STREET, MASCOTINSW 2020 Tel: 9693/1788 - Fax: 9317/5711 - Email: ask@tappoport.com.au Web: www.rappoport.com.au Page 42

HERITAGE VALUES ASSESSMENT = 32-34 CHURC | STREET, WOLLONGONG

APPENDIX A

Historical Extract from

Report on Test Excavation in Advance of proposed redevelopment, 32-34 Church Street, Wollongong, NSW

> Edward Higginbotham and Associates Pty Etd April 2010

RAPPOPORT PTY LTD - CONSERVATION ARCHITECTS & TERITAGE CONSULTANTS 45 HARDIE STREET, MASCOTINSW 2020 Tel: 9693/1788 - Fax: 9317/5711 - Email: ask@tappoport.com.au Web: www.rappoport.com.au Page 43

2 HISTORICAL BACKGROUND.

The historical background to this site was prepared by Terry Kass, historian. It outlines the owners, occupiers, land use and improvements, as indicated by historical documentation.

2.1 Charles Throsby Smith and 'Bustle Farm'

Charles Throsby was noted for his explorations southwards from Sydney. From his property at Minto, he explored southwards and was one of the earliest settlers on the Illawarra. John Oxley, the Surveyor-General, acknowledged Throsby's contribution in exploring unknown country. In 1819, Throsby's nephew, Charles Throsby Smith arrived in colony at the request of Charles Throsby. Throsby gave Smith the right to his grant of 300 acres in Illawarra that had been promised by Governor Lachlan Macquarie. Charles Throsby Smith later took up occupation of that land.⁷

Surveyor-General John Oxley directed Charles Throsby Smith in 1823 to occupy the land originally occupied by Charles Throsby. Smith spent a great deal of money on it afterwards.⁸ Surveyor James McBrien was ordered to mark out 300 acres at Illawarra for Charles Throsby Smith 'at Mr Throsby's old station on the coast' in March 1825.⁹

By 7 October 1826, when he applied for additional land, Smith stated that he held the 300 acre grant of which he had cleared 60 acres plus 70 cattle and 5 horses plus 'a Dwelling House value seventy five Pounds and Two Out Houses value Twenty Five Pounds' with 2 miles and 180 yards of fence. He had 3 convict servants, plus 25 acres of felled timber, two carts, two ploughs and one harrow.¹⁰

Up until 1828, Smith occupied a small house at what later became the corner of Harbour and Smith Streets in the town of Wollongong. He later built a larger house

^{7 29/1096,} Col Sec re Land, Charles Throsby Smith file, SRNSW 2/7972

⁸ 33/8124, Col Sec re Land, Charles Throsby Smith file, SRNSW 2/7972

⁹ C W Gardiner-Garden, *Port of Wollongong*, Illawarra Historical Society, Wollongong, 1975, p 11

¹⁰ 26/7399 (?), Col Sec re Land, Charles Throsby Smith file, SRNSW 2/7972

called 'Bustle Farm' or 'Bustle Hall'.¹¹ It is uncertain when this occurred but when Smith applied for 1,000 acres adjoining his farm on 29 October 1828, he gave his address as Bustle Farm', Illawarra.¹²

On 23 February 1829, when he applied for an additional grant, Smith stated that he had 300 acres, 6 horses and 86 cattle plus 'A Barn & Stabling 120£. Dwelling House & Kitchen 150£. Servants' Dwelling 45£.' He also had 3.5 miles of fence and employed 3 convict and 3 free servants.¹³ The value placed upon the house implies that he had built 'Bustle Hall' in its later location by then. A plan of the proposed Town of Wollongong completed in 1834 by H F White showed 'Bustle Hall' in that location (Figure 2.1).¹⁴

The land was formally granted to Charles Throsby Smith, of Wollongong on 20 December 1835. It was described as 300 acres bounded on the south, 60 chains, on the west, 63 chains, on the north, 38 chains 20 links and on the east by a fence, a lagoon etc. It was to be called 'Bustle Farm' and a public road was reserved through the grant.¹⁵

Smith became one of the notables of the emerging town of Wollongong and of the wider Illawarra area, taking a leading public role. When the Municipality of Wollongong was set up, he enjoyed sufficient public trust to be appointed as the Returning Officer for the election (Figure 2.1).

His wife Isabella Campbell Smith died on 31 July 1865. Smith later married Rhoda Wilmot Smith. Charles Throsby Smith died on 25 September 1876 leaving many descendants.¹⁶ On 1 March 1878, title to his grant was conveyed by various devisees of his will to Vincent Wanostrocht Giblin and Timothy O'Sullivan Green, as trustees for the sale of Smith's grant.¹⁷

¹¹ 'Reminiscences of Early Illawarra' by Alexander Stewart, cited in W G McDonald, *Earliest Illawarra by Its Explorers and Pioneers*, Illawarra Historical Society, Wollongong, 1966, p 46, 48

¹² Col Sec re Land, Charles Throsby Smith file, SRNSW 2/7981

¹³ 29/1688, Col Sec re Land, Charles Throsby Smith file, SRNSW 2/7972

¹⁴ Plan for the Town of Wollongong, 1834 (W.879), H F White, SR Map 5963

¹⁵ Grants, volume 43 no 20, LTO

¹⁶ Abstract in RPA 16091

¹⁷ LTOD, No 344 Bk 184

Smith's land was subdivided into 20 Sections with a grid of streets and was auctioned on 15 January 1879. 'Bustle Hall' was situated on Section 6 (Figures 2.3 and 2.4).¹⁸ As one of the early properties in the Illawarra, his farm functioned as a focus of early development. The subdivision of his land, which soon became known as 'Smith's Hill' was a significant determinant of the spread of Wollongong northwards.

2.2 'Buona Vista'

The successful bidder at the auction was Mary Ann Franklin, apparently using money separate from the estate of her husband. She and her husband were living in the former 'Bustle Hall' by mid 1879. On 29 July 1879, Vincent Wanostrocht Giblin and Timothy O'Sullivan Green, both of Sydney, gents, conveyed to Mary Ann Franklin, wife of Frederick Augustus Franklin, of 'Buona Vista', Wollongong, surveyor, and John Charles Manchee, of Phillips Creek, near Murrurundi, gent, as trustee, the land known as Lot 2 Section 6, Smith's Subdivision. The land measured 5 acres 3 roods 37 perches and was bounded on the east by Church Street, 396 feet, on the north by Lot 1, 658 feet, on the west by Keira Street, 396 feet, and on the south by Gipps Street, 658 feet. The purchase price was £830.¹⁹

She immediately mortgaged it to the Civil Service Building Society for £450 for 6 years.²⁰ The loan was discharged on 17 June 1885. ²¹ Another mortgage was made to the Civil Service Building Society, for £200 for 2 years on 1 December 1887.²² It was discharged on 2 November 1889.²³

Mary Ann Franklin of Buona Vista, Wollongong, wife of Frederick Augustus Franklin, died on 9 December 1905. A valuation was made of 'Buona Vista' by Batt, Rodd and Purves, which described it as being located on a block of about 6 acres with 'an old fashioned roomy Cottage, containing wide verandah, hall, 2 sitting and 4 bed

¹⁸ T S Parrott, Extension of the Town of Wollongong For Sale by Auction at Wollongong by Mr C F Smith 15th Jany 1879, ML Map M3/811.311/1879/1

¹⁹ LTOD, No 329 Bk 193

²⁰ LTOD, No 330 Bk 193

²¹ LTOD, No 872 Bk 311

²² LTOD, No 770 Bk 375

²³ LTOD, No 631 Bk 426

rooms, bath room, kitchen, servant's room and out offices – Detached stabling and out-house'. Its value was $\pounds 1,169.^{24}$ There was also a valuation of the furniture in the house (Figure 2.5).

A subdivision had been made of the land around 'Buona Vista/Bustle Hall' but it was not successful. Only one lot had been sold to Timothy Wood Lee. The plan was not deposited in the Land Titles Office and no copy has been found in any other archive or library.

On 9 May 1912, a deed of Conveyance was signed with the following parties - 1^{st} Perpetual Trustee Co Ltd, 2^{nd} Timothy Wood Lee, Wollongong, medical practitioner, 3^{rd} Joseph Matthew Staff, Fig Tree, near Wollongong, butcher, and William McKenzie, Wollongong, butcher. The land was Lot 2 Section 6, Smith's subdivision but excluded Lot 10 of Franklin's Subdivision, sold to Lee. The land sold for £1,500.²⁵

A plan of survey by T Roy Morse for a Real Property Application completed on 6 June 1912 showed 'Bustle Hall' on the site (Figures 2.6 and 2.7).²⁶ On 21 June 1912, Joseph Matthew Staff, of Fig Tree, near Wollongong butcher, and William McKenzie, of Wollongong butcher, submitted a Real Property Application for part of Lot 2 Section 6 of Smith's Subdivision. The house was then occupied by Walter Lance, of Wollongong, draper, as a monthly tenant.²⁷ On 21 January 1913, a CT was issued to Joseph Matthew Staff, of Fig Tree, near Wollongong, butcher, and William McKenzie, of Wollongong, butcher, for 5 acres 3 roods 22.25 perches.²⁸

Furthermore, in January 1913, the land was subdivided into 28 lots. Lot 4 facing Church Street included 'Bustle Hall' (Figure 2.8).²⁹

SRNSW 20/280

²⁴ Stamp Duties Office, Deceased Estate File. M A Franklin, duty paid 14/3/06,

²⁵ LTOD, No 647 Bk 965

²⁶ DP 67959

²⁷ RPA 17959

²⁸ C T 2334 f 76-7

²⁹ DP 7000

Almost contemporary with the subdivision was a Detail Survey for sewerage purposes by surveyor George Bellingham, dated as 9 May 1913, which showed the buildings on the site (Figure 2.9).³⁰

Lots 3-5 and 8-12 of DP 7000 were transferred to Margaret McKenzie, wife of William McKenzie, of Wollongong, butcher, on 4 January 1916.³¹

A valuation completed by the Valuer-General on 1 October 1922 showed that Lots 3 and 4 and part of Lot 5 of DP 7000 (CT vol 2642 fol 178) were occupied by a Brick and cast [sic] cottage, with 6 rooms and kitchen, with an iron roof. The owner was Margaret McKenzie, of Church Street, Wollongong. Its Unimproved Capital Value was £684 and the Improved Capital Value was £1375.³²

A new CT was issued to Margaret McKenzie, of Wollongong, widow, on 28 May 1929 for Lots 3, 4 and part of 5, DP 7000, after transfers of other parts of her holding.³³ Margaret McKenzie, of Wollongong, widow, died on 20 April 1933. A valuation of her land at No 32 Church Street, with the house 'Ellangowan' by the Valuer-General noted that it was occupied by a 'Bk Ctge, 6 rooms, K, Iron Rf, Garage & Tennis Court' and a value at £1,800.³⁴ A furniture valuation was also completed. (See Appendix 2).

The property passed by transmission to Maggie Stichnoch, wife of Ludwig Ferdinand Stichnoch of Mildura, metallurgist, on 26 September 1933.³⁵ A new subdivision of the land was completed on 24 August 1935. Lot 1 in that subdivision included the main part of 'Bustle Hall' (Figure 2.10).³⁶

³⁰ SR Map 15563

³¹ C T 2334 f 76-7

³² Valuer-General, Valuation Cards, Wollongong, SRNSW 13/7925, Card 515

³³ C T 4283 f 4

³⁴ Stamp Duties Office, Deceased Estate File, Margaret McKenzie, No 74459,

SRNSW 20/1752

³⁵ C T 4283 f 4

³⁶ DP 331687

On 6 September 1935, she transferred part of lot 4 and part lot 5 to Norman Bain Finlayson, of Wollongong, medical practitioner.³⁷ This included the main part of 'Bustle Hall'.

2.3 Lot 1 in DP 331687

A new CT for part of Lot 4 and part of Lot 5 was issued to Norman Bain Finlayson, of Wollongong, medical practitioner, on 14 October 1935 (Figure 2.10).³⁸ He had mortgaged it to the English Scottish and Australian Bank Ltd on 13 September 1935.³⁹ It seems that he demolished 'Bustle Hall' to erect other buildings. An aerial photo of 1937 appears to show a large flat roofed building on this site.⁴⁰ It certainly does not appear to be the same configuration as seen on earlier plans.⁴¹

His mortgage to the English Scottish and Australian Bank Ltd was not discharged until 2 May 1953.⁴² Lot 1 of DP 331687 was further subdivided into two lots known as A and B on 12 September 1959 (Figure 2.12).⁴³

Lot B of 10.75 perches was transferred to Edward Leslie Milgrave on 2 October 1959.⁴⁴ The residue consisted of Lot A of 1 rood 18.25 perches. ⁴⁵ The title to these lots was altered to CT 7967 f 238 and f 234, which were not researched any further.

2.4 Lot 2 in DP 331687

Lot 2 of DP 331687 consisted of Lot 3 and part of Lot 4 of DP 7000 (Figure 2.10). On 14 October 1935, a new CT was issued to Maggie Stichnoch, wife of Ludwig Ferdinand Stichnoch, of Mildura, metallurgist, for this land. She transferred it to

³⁷ C T 4283 f 4

³⁸ C T 4718 f 197

³⁹ C T 4718 f 197

⁴⁰ Another interpretation of this aerial photograph is that the site was vacant – Edward Higginbotham. Aerial Mosaic, Wollongong, 1937, SR Map 32145

⁴¹ Aerial Mosaic, Wollongong, 1937, SR Map 32145

⁴² C T 4718 f 197

⁴³ DP 415263

⁴⁴ C T 4718 f 197

⁴⁵ C T 4718 f 197

Norman Bain Finlayson, of Wollongong, medical practitioner, who then transferred it to Jess Elsie Sneddon, wife of Andrew Sneddon, of Wollongong merchant, on 24 April 1940, with a covenant that no flats were to be built on this site.

She mortgaged it to the Mutual Life and Citizens Assurance Co Ltd on 30 April 1940, which was discharged on 6 December 1943. It was transferred to Edward Leslie Milgrave of Wollongong, medical practitioner, on 6 December 1943. A mortgage to the Bank of New South Wales followed on 20 December 1943 to be discharged on 30 September 1975.

On 7 April 1965, the covenant preventing erection of flats was removed from the title. It passed by transmission to Rowena Vaughan Milgrave, of Wollongong, widow on 30 September 1975.⁴⁶

The title was later converted to a computer folio.

⁴⁶ C T 4718 f 204

2.5 Maps and plans.



Figure 2.1. H F White's plan of 1834 showed 'Bustle Hall' north of Wollongong. [NB North point is at bottom of map] Source: SR Map 5963



Figure 2.2. Charles Throsby Smith c. 1850. Source: NLA PIC R3401 LOC FS11



Figure 2.3. Auction sale plan of Smith's Estate. Source: ML Map M3/811.311/1879/1



Figure 2.4. Enlargement of auction plan to show 'Bustle Hall'. Source: ML Map M3/811.311/1879/1

Edward Higginbotham & Associates Pty Ltd. (02) 9716-5154.

Mayo's Auction Mart, ESTAPLISHED 1885 Grown Street, Wollongong I have inspected the furniture in the estate of M. R. Frantolin dood & place the values as follows:-1 Bandos Buite (5 pieces) 3.10.1 1 blong Calinat 1.10.1 1 trainut Card Lable 2.10.0 J. A. MAYO, Auctioneer AND Valuator. 3-10-0 1-10-0 2.10.0 SALES REFECTED 1.0.0 BT AUCTION OR PRIVATELY. 2 Small Carpote 1 Hearth Pour 7.6 Estates Manager. Bambro Lable 7 12..6 Prandrobe (place glass) (polisted pine) Calinet Cheel Wrawers (pine) 5.0.0 FIRE & LIVY 3.0.0 INSURANCE AGENT. 1.0.0 1.0.0 1 Chrai 10.0 HONEY TO LEAD 1 m. J. Washstand 1 M. J. Mashanna 1 M. J. Mashanna 1 Gelogan Jable 1 Chest Manen (ledar) Wollongong Invarianjo 20 Hec. 1905 Valuato 1-0-0 CURRENT BATES 2-10-0 OF INTEREST. 1-10:00 2-10-0 1-10-0 2.0-0 35:4:0

Figure 2.5. Furniture valuation for M A Franklin. Source: Stamp Duties Office, Deceased Estate File. M A Franklin, duty paid 14/3/06, SRNSW 20/280



Edward Higginbotham & Associates Pty Ltd. (02) 9716-5154.

Figure 2.6. Surveyor T Roy Morse's original survey for the Real Property Application, 1912. Source: DP 67959



Figure 2.7. A clearer re-drawn copy of Surveyor T Roy Morse's survey, 1912. Source: DP 67959



Figure 2.8. Buona Vista Estate. Source: DP 7000.



Figure 2.9. Detail Survey of May 1913. Source: SR Map 15563.



Figure 2.10. New survey of the site of August 1935. Source: DP 331687



Figure 2.11. Aerial photo of the site in 1937 that shows a large building on the site, which does not appear to be 'Bustle Hall'. Source: SR Map 32145



Figure 2.12. Subdivision of September 1959. Source: DP 415263

2.6 Historical photographs.



Plate 2.1. Bustle Hall, the residence of Charles Throsby Smith. Source. Source. Wollongong City Library. P03/P03026. Plate 2.2. View from Flagstaff Hill towards Mt Keira, with Bustle Farm among the trees on Smiths Hill. This photograph clearly shows how Bustle Farm was a landmark visible from all around the area. Source. Wollongong City Library. P02/P02782.